

PROCEEDINGS OF THE HISTORIC CONSERVATION BOARD

MONDAY, NOVEMBER 17, 2003

3:00 P.M., J. MARTIN GRIESEL ROOM, CENTENNIAL PLAZA II

The Historic Conservation Board met at 3:00 P.M., in the J. Martin Griesel Room, Centennial Plaza II, with members Raser, Senhauser, Spraul-Schmidt, Sullebarger, and Wallace present. Absent: Bloomfield, Kirk, and Kreider

MINUTES

The minutes of the Monday, November 3, 2003 meeting were unanimously approved (motion by Sullebarger, second by Spraul-Schmidt).

CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS AND ZONING VARIANCES, 119 MULBERRY STREET, OVER-THE-RHINE HISTORIC DISTRICT

Staff member Adrienne Cowden presented the staff report on this request for a Certificate of Appropriateness and Zoning Variances for the renovation of the building located at 119 Mulberry Street, a contributing resource within the Over-the-Rhine Historic District. The project was revised in response to the Board's comments given at a preliminary design review on August 11, 2003.

Ms. Cowden stated that following the preliminary design review, an engineer inspected the building and found the masonry to be in very good condition; however, he determined that the rear frame addition and the porch had serious structural issues. The applicant is therefore proposing to remove the two-story frame porch that extends across the east elevation and construct a two-story frame, side gable addition in its place. This addition will extend across the entire east elevation, increasing the front and rear elevation by one full bay. It will include a new front entrance, although the original front door will be retained, as suggested by the Board in the preliminary review. The rear frame addition will also be demolished and a new frame addition with a deck will be built on the existing stone foundation.

As proposed, the project would require side yard and rear yard variances. Ms. Cowden explained that due to the construction of the addition, the distance between 119 Mulberry and the property to the east is being reduced from 6' to 3'. A rear yard variance is required, even though the frame addition is being constructed on the existing foundation. The addition of the deck, which extends into the rear yard reduces the rear yard setback, but allows a prospective owner the outdoor space and city views from the property.

Ms. Cowden stated that the proposal could be modified to better meet the historic district guidelines by painting the brickwork to protect it from further deterioration. Furthermore, the simple wood deck railing on the rear addition should have a more finished appearance, and be either stained or painted. In reply to Mr. Raser, Ms. Cowden clarified that the railing should have a bottom rail.

The project architect/applicant Guy Humphries and owner Cathy Frank were present to respond to questions from the Board. Mr. Senhauser observed that the third story windows on the front façade are disproportionate to the building. He pointed out that the third floor windows of 143 Mulberry Street are typical of what would be seen on a three-story façade. Mr. Senhauser clarified that he was not objecting to the windows, but the

space between the windows. There should be a comparable distance between the lintel above the ground floor window and the sill of the second floor window, and the second floor lintel and third floor sill. Mr. Humphries agreed that he could lower the sill and maintain the rhythm. In reply to Urban Conservator Forwood, Mr. Senhauser stated that the sash should be a compatible 2/2 configuration.

BOARD ACTION

The Board voted unanimously (motion by Sullebarger, second by Spraul-Schmidt) to take the following actions:

1. Find that the renovations meet the Over-the-Rhine Historic District guidelines and approve a Certificate of Appropriateness with the following conditions:
 - a. The original masonry portion of 119 Mulberry Street shall be painted to protect the brickwork;
 - b. The second story deck shall be modified with a more finished railing, and the wood shall be either stained or painted;
 - c. The front elevation shall be modified to locate the third floor window sills at a level which maintains consistency among the openings and that the windows should be 2/2 double hung sash; and
 - d. Final construction drawings and any landscape plan be submitted to the Urban Conservator for approval prior to construction; and
2. Grant approval of the necessary Zoning Variances for the side and rear yard setbacks, finding that such relief:
 - a. Is necessary and appropriate in the interest of historic conservation so as not to adversely affect the historic, architectural or aesthetic integrity; and
 - c. Will not be materially detrimental to the public health, safety and welfare or injurious to the property in the district or vicinity.

**CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS AND DOWNTOWN DEVELOPMENT
REVIEW, 823 ELM STREET, NINTH STREET HISTORIC DISTRICT-**

The applicant, Wade Nassar, is applying for a Certificate of Appropriateness and Downtown Development Variance to retain the plywood sheets he installed over the storefront windows at 823 Elm Street, within the Ninth Street Historic District and the Downtown Development District (DDD). Mr. Nassar altered the storefront of N&M Mini Mart in response to a series of attempted robberies.

Covering the existing storefront windows is in direct opposition to the historic district and DDD guidelines, which emphasize the need to retain and maximize the transparency of storefronts.

BOARD ACTION

The Board voted unanimously (motion by Sullebarger, second by Spraul-Schmidt) to deny a Certificate of Appropriateness and a Downtown Development Variance for the work completed and further that all the storefront windows be reopened.

ADJOURNMENT

As there were no other items for consideration by the Board, the meeting adjourned.

William L. Forwood
Urban Conservator

John C. Senhauser
Chairman

Date